THUNDER, NO LIGHTNING

SLEEK MILITARY AIRCRAFT DRAW LARGE CROWDS TO MACDILL'S AIR FEST. THE EVENT CONTINUES TODAY, PHOTOS, 1B



WEATHER rain chance 0%

St. Petersburg Times **SUNDAY,** April 10, 2005



es that have run this microchip plant nea Orlando got millions in incentives. Now it may close.

A SPECIAL REPORT

Risky

The state uses millions in tax dollars to help certain companies create jobs. But does that strategy pay off for taxpayers?

By SYDNEY R FREEDBERG and CONNIE HUMBURG

To government officials, the giant factory south of Orlando had long been more than a microchip plant. It was the crown jewel of Florida's high-tech future, an economic engine that would generate good jobs and help transform the home of Mickey Mouse into "Silicon Wolfer Fact".

leb transform the home of Mickey Mouse into "Silicon Valley East."

So when AT&T threatened to move the plant to Spain in 1996, state and local government swung into action. They trained workers, bought equipment, skashed the company's taxes and even wrote new laws and interest to the plant to stay and the state of the first to get the plant to stay and the state of the state of

buyer materializes, the plant will close by the end of the year.

The nearly empty factory could be a symbol for the flaws that beset what government and business leaders call "economic development."

Since the mid 1990s, state and local governments in Florida have showered hundreds of millions of dollars in tax breaks, cash and other incentives on companies like ATRT that promise to invest and create jobs here.

In 2004-05 alone, an examination by the St. Petershur Times shows, Florida's economic development efforts could cost state government more than \$500-million. In a state with a \$61-billion proposed budget, \$900-million could pay for nearly 11,000 new teachers, prekindergarent classes for 150,000 4-year-olds and all of next year's tuition increase for more than 250,000 inversity students.

Supporters say they need incentives to overcome bids from other states and countries that spend even more than Florida to meet companies' demands.

Incentives generate tens of thousands of high-wage jobs, they say, billions in state investment, a business-friendly image and a higher land and the places see BUSINESS 14A

Please see BUSINESS 14A

The politics of red, Wal-Mart and blue

As the world's biggest retailer fights iticism from unions and others, the battle takes on political tones.

By MARK ALBRIGHT

BENTONVILLE, Ark. — Sam Walton, founder of the world's biggest retail empire, had little interest in politics. He often contributed to both sides in elec-tions in case he would need a favor. These days, his heirs and a new generation managing the country's largest private employer find themselves knee-deep

in partisan politics.

A growing public relations war over Wal-Mart Stores Inc. has developed its own special red state-blue state political dimension. The spin doctors are describing Wal-Mart either as a company that embedies that American entrepreneurial spirit and rewards hard work, or a greedy corporation that trives off corporate welfare and its workers' relative poverty. For organized labor, a bulwark of the Democratic Party, attacking nonunion Wal-Mart targets the company and Wallon's heirs, who have been writing big checks to the Bush White House. Republican candidates and conservative causes.

Last week, reaction to the relentless spread of

Last week, reaction to the relentless spread of

Wal-Mart echoed across the political spectrum from Rush Limbaugh to the Maryland statehouse.

Lawmakers in Annapolis agreed to require that any private employer of more than 10,000 people — Wal-Mart happens to be the only one to qualify must spend a minimum of 8 percent of payroll on employee health care. Seven other states concerned that too many low-wage Wal-Mart workers rely on Medicaid for health care are considering similar measures.

measures.

Meanwhile, in many city halls and courthouses, plots are being hatched to impose outright bans on such big-box stores — not for aesthetic reasons or

Please see WAL-MART 20A

NOT PERFECTION, JUST HAPPINESS



INSIDE

AN AFFAIR TO

Times senior

Susan Taylor Martin reflects on Britain's seemingly encless appetite for sex scandals — and wishes the new pair a break from tabloids. 13A

Wed at long last

Prince Charles and Camilla Parker Bowles marry before family and friends, then leave for Scotland.

Mew York Times

WINDSOR, England — Given all the twists of fate and circumstance that have conspired against it, perhaps the most wondrous thing about the wedding, on Saturday between Prince Charles and Camilla. But it did, and nothing went wong. On Saturday, after more than 30 star-crossed years, through other marriages, bitter diworces, violent public opprobrained familial disapproval, Charles and Camilla finally married.

When the couple emerged, arm in arm from their civil wedding service at the Guidhall in the middle of the Berkshire town of Windsor, west of London. Camilla had become not only the wife of the heir to the British throne, but also a bona fide member of the royal family. Hereafter, the former Mrs. Parker Bowles will be known officially as Her Royal Highness, the Duchess of Cornwall (unless she becomes queen, which she has said she does not want to do). The crowds on Saturday were estimated at about 20 000 oeoole, nothing like the 600,000 that turned

The crowds on Saturday were estimated at about 20,000 people, nothing like the 600,000 that turned



Kay Clash, 61, of Birmingham, England, joins the crowd outside the Guildhall on Saturday.

ut on that long-ago day when Charles married Lady

This was different, but not in a bad way. If there was a general mood in the ether during the long afternoon, which included a blessing of the wedding at St. George's Chapel in Windsor Castle, it was one indsor Castle, it was one and feathered, Please see **WEDDING** 12A frothy hats. **12A**

THE TIMES **ODAY**

An unusual cult of personality

The Coen brothers film The Big Lebowski attracts fans from around the world for Lebowski Fests. Times film critic Steve Persall joined kindred dudes for Fest No. 4. FLORIDIAN, 1E

Masterful DiMarco

Chris DiMarco has a strong lead over the field at Augusta, but Tiper Woods isn't giving up without a fight

SPORTS, 1C

Marial memories

Twenty-five years after the a writer who endured the voyage dispels some myths.

PERSPECTIVE, 1P

Unwelcome in Iraq

Tens of thousands of Iraqis march in Baghdad. demanding U.S. forces leave the country to police itself.

WORLD, 23A



Frozen beauty

weather and seas find Antarctica has fascinating landscapes, adventurou treks, penguins and lots of ice

TRAVEL, 17

INDEX

ALSO INSIDE TV Times Comics Parade

Outpouring for pontiff sways cardinals on his successor

■Their lips sealed Saturday, cardinals first let slip yearning for Pope John Paul II's charisma.

ROME — The Roman Catholic cardinals agreed Saturday to secre-cy, even before their oath at next

week's conclave, but since Pope John Paul IT's death many have been dropping hints about what kind of man the church now needs. The enormous outpouring of affection for Pope John Paul has clearly had an impact on their thinking. Many of the prelates said in noticeably similar language that the next pope must above all be a communicator who can sustain the grass roots enthusiasm, especially

among youth, that was generated by Pope John Paul II.

The With all but the of the 117 are it is highly outliefely that he new pope will depart from Pope John Paul's conservatism on contraception, divorce, women priests or the range of what the church considers to be "sanctity of life" issues from stem cell research to abortion and cuthanasia.

Local parishioners describe their ideal pope, "a man that will bring hope." 19A

Before the pope's death, many cardinals and commentators said a decisive factor would be geogra-phy — whether the next pope should come from Europe, where the church is shrinking, or from

Latin America, Africa or parts of Asia, where the church is experi-encing often uncontrolled growth.

encing often uncontrolled grown.

Instead, they say they are looking for someone who can project universal appeal with a personal humility and pastoral presence that embodies the message of the gospel, as they say Pope John Paul did. It is not, many cardinals said in

Please see POPE 18A

THE HIDDEN COST OF

THE HIDDEN COST OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
ECONOMIC development could cost the state of Florida an estimated \$900-million this year. The biggest chunk of that - \$792-million - is the potential revenue it loses through a series of tax breaks designed to encourage companies to invest breaks designed to encourage companies to invest breaks designed to encourage companies to constend in the state and create jobs. Because tax returns are confidential, it's often impossible for the public to find out confidential, it's often impossible for the public to find out which companies benefit and how much they get. Here are some of the tax breaks and an estimate of how much revenue Florida will lose because of each in 2004-05:

Tax breaks	2004-05 estimated cos
CORPORATE INCOME TAX	
Allows for a deduction of wages paid for targeted jobs in Flo	orida \$2,500,000
Credit of 5 percent of capital costs for up to 20 years	\$100,000
Credit for contributing to community projects	\$3,900,000
Credit for hiring in certain urban high-crime areas	\$1,400,000
Credit for hiring in certain rural areas	\$1,500,000
Credit for creating jobs in enterprise zone	\$900,000
Credit to new and expanding businesses in enterprise zone	\$1,000,000
Credit for child care facilities operated by a business for its employees	\$2,000,000
Exemption for certain banks catering to foreign customers	\$9,800,000
Deduction for businesses that do research and development in conjunction with state universities	\$3,100,000
DOCUMENTARY STAMP TAX	
Exemption for certain international banking transactions	\$29,700,000
INSURANCE PREMIUM TAX	
Credit for a percent of wages paid to employees located in Florida	\$196,900,000

Credit for investing in certain venture capital firms

Credit for contributing to community projects

Exemption for accounts receivable, money owed to a company by a customer for products and services provided on credit

MOTOR FUEL TAX

in the state	
➤ SALES AND USE TAX	
Exemption on leases or rentals of property used for movie production	\$4,900,000
Exemption to encourage commercial fish breeding and beekeeping	\$100,000
Exemption on items manufactured for research and development activities	\$32,100,000
Exemption for items manufactured for movie productions	\$8,500,000
Exemption for printing for out-of-state customers when they provide the paper	\$15,900,000
Exemption for sales or leases of materials and equipment used by film schools	\$800,000
Exemption on equipment purchased by new businesses	\$24,100,000
Exemption on equipment purchased by expanding	\$26,300,000

Refund for certain movie and recording equipment \$2.600.000 Exemption on equipment purchased by expanding printing facilities \$9,400,000 Exemption for motion picture video equipment \$4,700,000 Refund for certain motion picture or recording equipment \$2,600,000 \$13,800,000 Exemption for building material used by businesses

Exemption for equipment used in silicon technology \$100,000 Exemption for semiconductor clean rooms Refund for certain depreciable equipment used by the defense and space industry \$2,100,000

Exemption for equipment used by businesses in enterprise zones

Exemption for businesses that do certain aircraft modifications Exemption on construction materials used in single-family homes in enterprise zone Exemption on building materials in redevelopment projects

\$8.000.000 Credit for contributing to community projects Exemption for newspapers and magazines delivered by mail \$11,300,000 Exemption on labor charges for repair and maintenance of certain airplanes \$2,700,000 \$200,000

Exemption on labor charges for repair and maintenance of certain helicopters Exemption on parts and labor for certain aircraft repair and maintenance

Exemption on electricity charges used to operate manufacturing machinery and equipment \$52,300,000 Exemption on purchase of solar energy systems \$1,200,000 Exemption on shipping, parts and lebor for machinery repair \$12,700,000 Exemption on sales or lease of certain aircraft by airline companies \$2,800,000

Exemption on materials used by certain printing businesses \$6,400,000 Partial exemption on aircraft brought to Florida for repairs \$6,900,000 Partial exemption on equipment purchased, used or leased to produce records, tapes and motion pictures in Florida \$400,000 Exemption on electrical charges used in enterprise zone Exemption on satellites, space vehicles and property placed on satellites

> \$1,400,000 \$5,600,000

\$2,900,000

\$792,100,000

\$2,100,000

\$2,500,000

\$300,000

\$2,700,000

the company reported paying \$88.7million in state and local taxes last year. In addition to the \$792-million in tax breaks, Florida has earmarked \$119-million this year for the economic development bureaucracy and a rat of incentives for individual companies. They range from outright cash payments to training grants to road-building funds given to local governments to training grants to road-building funds given to local governments on behalf of companies that promise to create jobs. Only about \$80.00 for \$10.00 for \$10.00

Governor disputes Times' findings

The office of Gov. Jeb Bush, which touts the state's economic development efforts, takes issue with some of the findings in today's St. Petersburg

Times report.

Pamella Dana, who as director of the governor's Office of Tourism, Trade and Economic Development oversees the state's economic development efforts, declined to speak to the newspaper.

But in a statement last fall, the

the newspaper.

But in a statement last fall, the governor's office said it had "serious concerns about what appears to be an intentional decision" by the paper to accept only facts that support its theories and "disregard those that



A statement from Jeb Bush's office said

tives programs as a rigorous, contract based process. "A company must meet the job creation terms of its contract in order to receive any tax relund," the statement said. "If the company fails to meet these terms it does not receive the tax refund. Period,"

Florida is a long-term strategy."

may call them into question, or prove them wrong outright."

In the statement, the governor's office: obto issue with the newspaper's analysis of the annual cost of economic development; calling it "more than mistacding."

Defended its oversight of tax incentials and there is inherent risk in business and — though it is an exception

rather than the rule — some economic development projects will not produce the desired results due to mar ket conditions and economic results. The governor's office also urged the paper to examine some of the saccess stories of economic development. If suggested four examples, One of them was JPMorgan Clase & Co., which has Tocated several major projects in Hilbsborough County in response to incentives offered by the state and community.

Three months later, JPMorgan Chase amounced it will close its credit card call center in Tampa by the end of this year and eliminate 1,000 jobs.

Business from 14A

dominated by executives from banks, utilities, real estate and large firms that sometimes benefit from incenives themselvets.

Throughout the 1990s, dozens of similar public-private partnerships grew up across the state as the roles of industry and government became intertwined.

\$15,000,000

\$300,000

of industry and government became introvinced in district and problems of industry and government became introvinced in the state of the control of the cont

Shrouded in secrecy

Shrouded in secrecy

The state's share of the total bill could top \$909-million in 2004-05, according to a Times analysis.

Most of that will come from tax breaks designed to encourage companies to plow money into plant expansion, new equipment, people and research and thus spur growth in the businesses and the economy. But the state seldom evaluates whether the tax breaks are working.

Over the years, the Legislature has created more than 50 of these tax breaks, sometimes at the behest of a business or a few businesses bolbying for incentives. Combined, the tax breaks, sometimes at the behest of a breaks could mean a loss of more than 5792-million in revenue this year. (When the governor's offee tailles the cost of economic development, it omits many of these tax subsidies, saying they are not incentives but part of Florida's business friendly tax structure available to any company.)

Since tax returns are coinfidential, the state Revenue Department is not allowed to say — and in some cases doesn't even know — which companies benefit on how much they deet.

The governor's office does, however, identify businesses that get some of the tax breaks, including firms that promise to create jobs in special low-tax areas designated by the company of the second of the say the special content of the say th

S2X-Dillion in revenues last year and a workforce larger than those of General Motors, Ford, General Electric and IBM combined.

Wal-Mart says incentives are "a jackpot investment" because it past mrore in state and local taxes than it gets in tax breaks and other forms of government law. government aid. With 91,000 Florida employees,

the company reported paying \$58.7-million in state and local taxes

FLORIDA WAGES: A DECADE LATER, STILL BEHIND

When Florida joined the state bidding war for jobs in the mid 1990s, a key goal was to raise Floridians' wages, which lagged behind the national average. Today, Florida is a national leader in job growth and population growth. But the latest full-year statistics show that, if anything, Florida fallen a bit further behind on wages.

Year	Fla. population*	U.S. population*	All Fla. jobs**	All U.S. jobs**	Fla. wages***	U.S. wages***	Fla. compared to U.S.	% below U.S. avg.	State wages ranked high to low***
1993	13,679,000	257,782,608	5,575,078	109,402,016	\$24,670	\$27,080	91.1%	8.9	24th place
2003	17,071,508	290,788,976	7,248,097	127,795,827	\$34,520	\$38,490	89.7%	10.3	26th place
Change	25%	13%	30%	17%	40%	42%			

*Sources: U.S. Comsus Bureau (User U.S.), University of Florida-Bureau of Economic and Business Research (for FL)
**Sources: U.S. Department User and Buseau of Labor Solatiscs
***Average annual wage per non-farm worker; Source: Philip Hopkins, managing director, U.S. Regional Services, Global Insight
***Average annual wage per non-farm worker; Source: Philip Hopkins, managing director, U.S. Regional Services, Global Insight
**Times dart = TERSANNE COSSETTA, CONNIE HUMBURG and SYDNEY FREEDERIG

UNMET PROMISES

UNMET PROMISES

Two of Florida's incentive programs, the Qualified Target Industry Tax Refund and the Qualified Defense Contractors Tax Refund, allow preapproved companies to get tax refunds for creating at least 10 jobs with wages that are at least 11 jobs with wages that are at least 11 jobs in the state; county or metropolitan area. The state usually pays 80 percent of the refund and local government the other 20 percent. The governor's office, which administers the programs, says it staggers the refunds over at least four years so companies get refunds only after paying taxes and meeting scheduled job and wage targets. Between 1994 and June 2004, the state certified 512 business projects under those two programs, according to a Times analysis. So far, only six of those projects have been completed, getting state tax refunds totaling \$3.2-million. Of the remaining 506 projects, 294 are ongoing and 212 have been declared inactive by the state.

Here are the only six projects that the state says are now complete

Company	County	Approval Date	Project	Jobs Promised	State paid
Hancor Inc.	Highlands	12/5/96	Plastic pipe manufacturing	45	\$133,016
Northrop Grumman Corp.	St. Johns	6/29/94	Defense contractor	295	\$1,180,000
Sanderson Pipe Corp.	Baker	5/22/96	PVC pipe manufacturing	- 50	\$180,000
St Paul Fire & Marine Insurance Co.	Hillsborough	9/24/96	Workers' compensation processing	50	\$140,000
Tracor Inc.	Okaloosa	11/14/94	Defense contractor	95	\$380,000
VoiceStream Wireless	Hillsborough	5/23/96	Customer service/data center	375	\$1,200,000
/				Total	· \$3 213 016

Here are 44 projects that got partial tax refunds for meeting part of their scheduled goals, then were declared inactive and ineligible for further refunds because they failed to meet additional job or wage targets:

Company	County	State paid	Company	County	State paid
Agere Systems	Orange	\$85,000	Joseph E Seagram & Sons Inc.	Palm Beach	\$236,483
Agere Systems	Orange	\$1,649,000	Martin Marietta Corp.	Orange	\$100,000
Althin Medical Inc.	Dade	\$110,400	National Auto Finance Co.	Duval	\$104,500
AmeriCredit	Clay	\$166,400	NEXTLINK Florida Inc.	Dade	\$134,400
Arthur Andersen LLP	Sarasota	\$1,021,940	Northrop Grumman Corp.	Duval	\$42,312
Atlantic Dry Dock Corp.	Duval	\$198,360	Northrop Grumman Corp.	Martin	\$250,000
AvBorne Heavy Maintenance Inc.	Dade	\$211,281	Oracle Corp.	Orange	\$904,000
Banco Popular	Orange	\$126,920	Oracle Corp.	Orange	\$475,000
Barnett Inc.	Duval	\$214,800	Oracle Corp.	Orange	\$188,100
lear Stearns & Co. Inc.	Hillsborough	\$181,600	· Oracle Corp.	Orange	\$240,000
asi-Rusco Inc.	Palm Beach	\$60,000	Pan American World Airways Inc.	Dade	\$49,178
GI Group	Pinellas	\$79,899	PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP	Hillsborough	\$32,000
GI Group	Pinellas	\$87,328	ProSource Inc.	Dade	\$135,000
GI Group	Pinellas	\$116,227	Proven Edge Inc.	Pinellas	\$30,568
hep USA	Orange	\$69,210	Regeneration Technologies	Alachua	\$106,600
reative Games International Inc.	Hillsborough	\$23,369	Rexall Sundown Inc.	Palm Beach	\$46,875
uraGen Corp.	Alachua	\$36,000	Standard Motor Products Inc.	Orange	\$32,256
atametrics Corp.	Orange	\$61,029	Terra Networks Operations Inc.	Dade	\$12,000
ayco Products Inc.	Marion	\$323,400	Tom's Foods	Taylor	\$27,600
ousehold International	Hillsborough	\$78,000	Uniroyal Optoelectronics	Hillsborough	\$172,000
umana Health Insur. Co. of Fia.	Duval	\$694,000	USBI Co.	Brevard	\$21,825
terVoice-Brite	Seminole	\$176,000	Wartsila NSD North America Inc.	Broward	\$29,400
/				Total: \$	9,140,260

Sources: Governor's Office of Tourism, Trade and Economic Development

Times chart - TERESANNE COSSETTA, CONNIE HUMBURG and SYDNEY FREEDBERG

tions.

There is also a third kind of spending that puts Florida's total well above \$900-million. The state will distribute about \$21,7-million this year in sales tax revenue on behalf of the World Golf Half of Fame north of SA. Augustine, the International Game Fish Association Fishing Half of Fame and Museum in Dania Beach and pro sports facilities, notably those for the Florida Marins, Jacksonville Jaguars. Tampa Bay Devil Rays, Tampa Bay Leylightning, Florida Panthers, Tampa Bay Buccaneers and Miami Heat.

The \$900-million tab does not include the incentives provided by local and federal government. Businesses can get everything from free land and wastewater treatment plants to federal training funds. Something as simple as a change of zoning from "rural" to "business" can increase the value of a property a thousand-fold.

The total cost of federal, state and local incentives is hard to track because Florida apparently does not keep a combined list of costs.

Florida does publish a yearly report disclosing federal, state and local costs of incentives used in "enterprise zones," the low-tax areas that get special programs to spur jobs and investment there.

In 2003-04, the tab came to

ivestment there. In 2003-04, the tab came to

\$87.7-million for 7.702 promised jobs in 51 zones. The cost per job: \$11,392. A lead player in the deal making is the governor's Office of Tourism. Trade and Economic Development, an Syear-old agency with about 20 employees. It works with the Legislarure, business leaders and economic development groups like Enterprise Florida to set policy. It oversees some but not all incentives and approves deals recommended by Enterprise Florida.

By law, the trade office, known in government and business circles; as

government and business circles as OTTED, doesn't have to disclose key information, including the wages and taxes that companies getting incen-

"For these programs to be effec-"For these programs to be enter-tive incentives, businesses using them must not feel that their detailed records are being exposed to public dissemination where they will be available for their competitors to see," the governor's trade office wrote in a report to the Legislature in 2001

2001.
Some small businesses say, however, that incentive deals them selves give unfair advantages to the firms chosen to get them — often at the expense of homegrown companies that never threaten to leave town. "It's robbing from the poor to give

and STONEY FREEDERG.
to the - rich." lawyer Michael
Woodward told the Putnam County
Commission in May 2000 before it
gave 22 acres and millions of tollars
for Sykes Enterprises to build a call
center in Palaka." If you want to belp
someone, help your own people."
Four years and many incentives
later, Sykes eliminated its Palatka
workforce and put its building up for
sale.

The same fate

Hundreds of newly hired workers at the chip plant near Orlando met the same unhappy fate.

The factory processes silicon waters, the millimeter-thick plates that are cut into the tiny chips inside desk-top computers and cell phones.

ATAT's equipment subsidiary. Western Electric, amounced it would build the plant in 1980 and hire at least 1,500 employees and possibly more later (SEE TIMELINE, 16A).

From the start, there were gener ous incentives 85 smillion for roads and sever upgrandes. S184, 335 for water mann extensions, generous permits so the plant could use huge water mains extensions, generous permits so the plant could use huge quantities of water and wastewater, a new electric substation built on Western's property—with enough

Please see BUSINESS 16A

Sources: 2004 Florida Tax Handbook, Florida Senate and Florida Department

Credit for creating jobs in enterprise zone

Credit for sales tax paid on equipment and machinery by new and expanding phosphate mines

Total for 55 exemptions, deductions, refunds or credits

Times chart - TERESANNE COSSETTA, CONNIE HUMBURG and SYDNEY FREEDBERG

RISKY BUSINESS: A SPECIAL REPORT

AN UP-AND-DOWN HISTORY

The microchip plant near Orlando has been run by a series of companies that have gone from high-tech boom to the brink of bankruptcy.

A CHIP PLANT SCORE CARD

Did the incentives from state and local government pay off? In the long run, they rarely do, some economists say, because government spends more for additional public services such as police, schools and severs to handle the business and its new employees. But government downplays the cost side of development. If focuses instead on the increase in local taxes and the money a growing business and its amployees spend, meaning more tax revenues. Here are some of the key numbers for the chip plant near Orlando.

WHAT	THE	PLANT	OWNERS	GOT-

THAT THE PLANT OWN!	ERS GOT:	
mployee training grants		\$777,144
ash incentives		\$7,700,000
other county savings**		\$8,658,928
ounty tax breaks from 19	97-2003	\$3,101,655
tate tax breaks from 1997	7-2003***	\$29,328,964
Vater, wastewater use	About 2-mi	llion gallons a day

A \$6-million value

Number of jobs at peak* \$100,000,000 Annual payroll at peak* Real estate taxes 1996-2004 \$4,786,809 \$61,434,051 Other local taxes for 1997-2004 Company donation of sales tax savings ****\$27,384,984 to U\$F and UCF

State corporate income and sales taxes

Contributions to Florida schools and local charities***** \$8,800,000

***Includes sales tax exemption on equipment, estimate of sales tax reduction or exemption electricity for *999-2001 and tax refunds for jobs. ***Much of the \$27-million donation – which was matched by the state – was used to buy quipment that was leased back to the company.

Times graphic - TERESANNE COSSETTA, CONNIE HUMBURG and SYDNEY FREEDBERG

1980: ATBT's equipment division, Western Electric, announces plans for a microchip plant to employ 1,500, and possibly more. Gov Bob Grahards administration and Orange County provide generous permits and pay at least \$5.5-million to build roads and infrastructure jo accommodate the plant.

1985; Plant opens.

1987: AT&T subsidiary, which inherited plant after breakup of the telephone monopoly, lays off 77 production employees at the plant.

1989: The plant says it will eliminate 117 jobs as plant production employment drops to about 540.

1994: ATE says it plans to add about 100 scientists at the plant even as the company sheds 436 other jobs in Central Florida.

1995: Gov. Lawton Chiles' administration and Orange County pledge more than \$9-million in tax refunds, cash, training aid and road money after AT&T executives announce they have a \$90-million offer to expand their chip plant in Spain.

1996: Control of plant passes to Lucent Technologies, which considers new high-tech projects "on par with or greater than what Well Diseav World represents to the tourism industry." The company asks for additional incentives, including research and training support from the Universities of Central Florida and South Florida. Legislature offers more funding.

1997: Legislature creates new sales tax break on high-tech equipment and new cash incentive program. County agrees to pay \$1,681,667 for additional wastewater capacity over

1998: Lucent announces joint venture to make chips in Singapore. State and county offer up to \$35-million in tax breaks and cash over 10 years. In turn, plant agrees to

invest \$287-million in a branch of renowned Bell Labs, with 200 employees making an average salary of \$58,750; says it will donate up to \$20-million in sales tax savings to UCF and USF, making the schools eligible for an additional \$20-million from state.

1999: Orange County Commission approves up to \$8.2-million over eight years for a new plant upgrade with 100 new jobs. City of Orlando kicks in \$1-million over five years as Lucent becomes third-largest taxpayer in county-behind Disney and Universal.

2000: Office of Gov. Jeb Bush agrees to up to \$6.5-million in "performance grants" for a \$700-million investment and 100 jobs with an average annual salary of at least \$38,000. Lucent denies rumors of job shift to Singapore as plant employment peaks at more than 1,800.

2001: Plant cuts about 600 workers; informs county utilities division it will ship some "backgrinding" equipment overseas. Lucent, which spins off plant to Agere Systems, gets tax refunds of more than \$12-million for overpaying state taxes. County agrees to extend deadline for plant to request incentive payments.

2002: Agere announces factory is for sale. State water board renews permit for plant to use up to 2.1-million gallons of water a day despite recent drought and watering restrictions in Central Florida.

2003: Governor's office certifies Agere for additional sales

2004: Agere says it will close plant by end of 2005 if buyer can't be found. Employment at plant drops to about 600.

2005: Economic development officials try to lure buyer with incentives

Source: Times research, Orlando Sentine

Business from 15A

juice to power 38,000 residential customers.

juice to power 38.000 residential customers.

Despite the concessions, the plant never operated at full capacity. First, the project was put on hold as AT&T fought to preserve its telephone monopoly in court. Then, after the breakup of the monopoly. ATACT struggled with layoffs, corporate upheavals, younger, more feisty telecom rivals and cheap chips from Japan.

More government aid was on the way, however: Three times in the 1990s, AT&T and its corporate off-spring dangled the possibility of a major plant upgrade with more jobs or hinted that the plant would leave town — or both. And each time, state and local government scrambled to come up with more incentives — all the while reassuring taxpayers that the factory was turning a region of low-paying tourism jobs into a high-tech, high-wage mecca.

"The investment will include three to four generations of technology, thus guaranteeing a commitment to Florida and Orlando of many years to come," a local business group wrote on behalf of AT&T in July 1995.

From that point untal 2003, Florida, Orange County and the city of

a local obstines group wrote on berian of ATRXT in July 1995.

From that point until 2003. Florida, Orange County and the city of Orlando passed new incentive laws. relaxed rules, signed at least 10 agree-ments and dispensed an assortment of benefits worth at least \$49-million. The benefits included tax breaks, cash, training aid, sewer discounts and high-tech equipment. Exactly how much public money was pumped into the plant isn't clear, however, because Florida didn't keep (or wort disclose) a list of combined costs for this or any other incentive deal

won't disclose) a list of combined costs for this or any other incentive deal. Before Gov. Chiles' administration approved the first deal in 1995, a key deputy said his staff had done a thorough review and had a stringent system in place to ensure that the company fulfilled its promises. Yet over the years, the state relied heavily on the word of AT&T and its successors. There were no safeguards against layoffs, no provisions to give hiring preference to local vendors and no requirement that the plant owners retain the new jobs for any prolonged period.

By July 2001, less than two years after the last incentive agreements,



GOOD NEWS AMID THE TURMOIL



In July 2011, the Orlando hip plant was in turmoil. It had begun laying off hundreds of workers, and its owner — Lucent Technologies — was transferring ownership to its Agere Systems subsidiary while trying to rebound from a junk-bond rating. A month late, the governor's top trade deputy, Pr. Pemiella Dane, approved tax refunds of \$585.262 to Lucent for meeting all of its previous-year commitments on jobs, wages and taxes paid. Her letter to the company included this handwritten note: "Congratulations on your continued success!"

high tech had hit the skids. Lucent Technologies, which had taken over the plant and was spinning it off to its Agere Systems subsidiary. And gotten a junk-bond credit rating.

The Orlando Sentinel reported that the plant had fallen below the minimum threshold of jobs needed to qualify for county incentives.

Even so, Gov. Bush's top trade deputy, Dr. Pamella Dana, approved tax refunds for S865/250, swing that the plant had met all of its previous-year state job commitments. Her approval letter, dated Aug. 20, 2001, came with a handwritten note: "Comparabilations on your continued success."

In September, Agere's executives

In September, Agere's executives told the state they couldn't meet the terms of their agreements. They

orried they would have to return the

worned they would nave to return the money.

Dana told them not to worry.

"There is no statutory requirement, nor is it ... (the state's) practice, to require qualified applicants to forfeit prior year award payments if they cannot meet current year requirements."

she said in a letter dated Oct. 22, 2001.

Agere put the factory up for sale in January 2002, but a year later Dana endorsed a new round of sales tax breaks for Agere.

Now, unless the company can find a buyer by the end of the year, it will close the plant.

A megaboost or bust?

So were all the incentives worth it? Yes, says the state, which denies its

treatment of the plant was too lenient. In fact, Openshaw, the governor's trade office spokesman, said that Florida's use of incentives in the case of the plant and other companies is conservative by comparison to other states.

e also said that, unlike some es, Florida hands out benefits only after companies create jobs and pay

taxes.
"You might argue that the state didn't maximize its investment, but neither did it lose money." Openshaw said. Florida enjoyed 500 new jobs paying \$20,000 above the county average for a long time, he said.
Agere says it and its predecessors made up for all the inducements with a \$100 million payroll. at least \$66 million in local taxes and at least \$31 million in donations to public universities, schools and charities.
"There is no doubt that the invest-

universities, schools and charties.
"There is no doubt that the investments made by the community have paid off many times over," said Seven Goldsmith, a spokesman for Agere.
John Lewis, Orange County's economic development administrator, said the deal paid off because the county crafted "smart agreements"

"The company had a plan to sell these jobs overseas," says former union leader Nicholas Frisco, who retired from the plant's maintenance storeroom in 2002.

with safeguards so that the company got paid only for goals it met. The county paid \$3.1-million of the originally promised \$22-million, he said.

"We did not 'give away the farm,' as they say," Lewis said, noting that Orange could have lost all the jobs and millions in tax revenue if the plant had moved out of state in 1995.

The largest beneficiaries were USF and UCF, where administrators say and UCF, where administrators say Lucent's deep pockets brought new state-of-the-art labs stocked with high-tech equipment, training and research programs for future engineers and a new day for university-industry part

new day for university and the schools, the incentives had a downside. The universities spent much of the corporate more which was matched by state funder which was matched by state funder to the control of the company and installed at the plant for comparerial chimaking operafor commercial chipmaking opera-

tions.

When the leases are up, the universities could end up selling much of the aging equipment for a fraction of its

鸡

original value.

Some former chip workers, who lost their pensions as well as their jobs, say government wasted millions on a mirage of job creation.

"The company had a plan to sell these jobs overseas, and it seemed like it accelerated and happened under our noses," said Nicholas Frisco, a former union leader who earned about \$42,000 a year plus benefits working in the plant's maintenance storeroom. He resigned in 2002 at age 56 after 35 years with the telephone company.

Debra Aul, who went back to school after she was laid off in 2001, now teaches and does freelance editing. She said the company should be held accountable for not keeping its part of the bargain. She wonders when the government first noticed that tax breaks were subsidizing the moving van.

"Those jobs are now in Singanore."

mat tax breaks were substituting the moving van. "Those jobs are now in Singapore," she said. "When did they find out? Did they turn a blind eye? Or were they truly clueless?"

Times researchers Kitty Bennett and Carolyn Edds contributed to this repo

Support The Salvation Army

Life Income Plan

Charitable Gift Annuity Depending on Age & Circumstances you could qualify for a rate from

5.3% **b** 11.3%

guaranteed. And support the programs of The Salvation Army



at the same time. For more information call: 1-800-758-2769 Ext.5706

Send this coupon today for more information. The Salvation Army - Planned Giving Department

P.O. Box 270848, Tampa, FL 33688 Address City, State, ZIP _ #24 SpPrT mes 4 05 CGA 49114



BEXTRA

If You Have Taken Bextra And Had A Heart Attack or Stroke



JOYCE AND REYES LAW FIRM (813) 251-2007 or TOLL FREE (888) 771-1529 Se habla Español

The hiring of a lawyer is an important decision that should not be based solely upon advertisements. Before you decide, ask us to send you free written information about our qualifications and experience. Principle office Tampa.